



PATRICIA H. *and* RICHARD E. GARMAN  
ART CONSERVATION DEPARTMENT  
BUFFALO STATE • The State University of New York

1300 Elmwood Avenue  
Rockwell Hall 230  
Buffalo, NY 14222-1095  
P: (716) 878-5025 F: (716) 878-5039  
artconservation.buffalostate.edu  
artcon@buffalostate.edu

## Research, Scholarship, and Creative Activity in the Conservation of Art and Cultural Heritage (2024 Revision)

### 1. Introduction

The Patricia H. and Richard E. Garman Art Conservation Department outlines in this document the various research, scholarship, and creative activities used to evaluate its faculty members. This document defines assessment criteria, specifies evaluation weightings, and outlines expected contribution levels for renewal, promotion, and continued appointment (tenure). While comprehensive, the list of activities is not exhaustive. The document provides guidelines for the joint drafting by the department and dean's office, of letters of expectation for new faculty members. It also provides a basis for evaluating faculty eligibility for promotion, tenure, and/or discretionary salary increase.

This document references university statements on the evaluation of research, scholarship, and creative activity, issued by the Academic Affairs Office and the School of Arts and Sciences. Primary among those statements is the "Buffalo State Directory of Policy Statements, Section VI: [Personnel Policies](#)."\* The requirements outlined in the "School of Arts and Sciences Documentation for Reappointment and Promotion [Reviews](#)"\* are also considered.

Earlier versions of this document were accepted by the Arts and Humanities Dean's and Academic Affairs Offices (accepted on 12/16/85). Minor alterations were made and submitted in February 1997 and accepted on 8/28/97. These alterations were written to be consistent with all statements issued on the title topics by the college since 1985. The document was updated again in November 2017. The document considered the special aspects of graduate education and training in art conservation leading to a degree.

The current document is a revision of the November 2017 version. It has updated criteria, consolidated specific activities, and additions to account for changes in the way information is currently disseminated.

### 2. Assessment Guidelines

The attached table lists the major activities in the conservation of art and cultural heritage which are noted as research, scholarship, and/or creative activity as indicated by the code letters R, S, and C, respectively. Each activity has been assigned a relative significance rating, or rating range (with minor variation signified by + or -), using letters A (high), B (considerable), and C (notable). For items published in journals, the impact factor should also be considered; higher factors indicate journals with higher citations and, thus, higher readership. These journals should

\* These documents are subject to change and should be reviewed carefully to ensure expectations are met accordingly.

be rated higher, when applicable. It is important to note that the field of conservation is relatively small and specific journals within the field may offer similar appropriate exposure. Where they may not offer the same volume of dissemination that higher impact factor journals hold, the target audience is more focused. As such, publications in these journals should hold special consideration.

To define the significance of a contribution to research, scholarship, and/or creative activity (whether it is listed and rated in the table), the department uses the following eight criteria: originality, significance, erudition, precision/clarity, thoroughness, locus of presentation, outside opinion, and cognition.

The criteria are defined on the next page preceding the rating table. Note that, as applied in the evaluation process, they are not necessarily independent factors. For example, outside opinion, as obtained from professional colleagues in the candidate's specialty, may be required to properly assess some of the others, including erudition, originality, significance, and cognition.

Faculty members are expected to initiate and maintain their own research, scholarly, and creative projects throughout their tenure in the department. Faculty members are also expected to participate in group research, scholarship, and creative activities based on the categories described below. Specific requirements are outlined in letters of expectations and typically include attendance and presentation at national and international conferences, publications in recognized peer-reviewed journals, and formal interactions with conservation-related associations. Although each faculty member is not required to perform more in one area than another, the department encourages all members to present their scholarship, research, and creative activities to fellow professionals to contribute to the advancement of the field, thereby enhancing their professional reputations and that of the department and university.

## **DEFINITION OF THE CRITERIA USED TO EVALUATE RESEARCH, SCHOLARSHIP, AND CREATIVE ACTIVITY IN ART CONSERVATION**

**Originality:** The independence of the contribution in its materials, approaches, and methods from those that have been made by other conservation professionals. The significant new synthesis of old concepts and techniques.

**Significance:** The impact of the contribution on the profession and/or the public in supporting the advancement of art conservation.

**Erudition:** The contribution reflects the contributor's mastery of the relevant specific and general aspects of current art conservation principles and practices and their relationship to allied fields.

**Precision/Clarity:** The intelligibility of the contribution to peer professionals or to others with the knowledge to comprehend it.

**Thoroughness:** The extent to which the contribution includes all relevant details, draws upon past and present knowledge, and utilizes and/or refers to the significant related contributions of others.

**Locus of Presentation:** The principal critical audience to which the contribution has been submitted by the contributor.

**Outside Opinion:** The considered opinions of the contribution given by those possessing the particular knowledge to accurately assess it, yet who have no immediate personal association with the contributor.

**Cognition:** The extent to which the contribution demonstrates the contributor's mastery, particularly intellectual, of the field of which the contribution is a part.

**TABLE OF PROFESSIONAL CONTRIBUTIONS AND RECOGNITION IN ART  
CONSERVATION RESEARCH, SCHOLARSHIP, AND CREATIVE ACTIVITY**  
(2024 Revision)

Notes regarding entries in the table columns:

1. In the “Category” column, S=scholarship, R=research, and C=creative activity. (An asterisk after a category letter indicates that although that category does not pertain directly to the activity, it is associated with previous activities that made the listed activity possible. For example, presenting a paper on a professional subject is itself a component of scholarship, although it may be based on research previously carried out by the speaker.)

2. In the “Significance Rating” column, ratings are A (high), B (considerable), and C (notable).

| <u>PROFESSIONAL CONTRIBUTION/RECOGNITION</u> | <u>SIGNIFICANCE</u> |               |
|----------------------------------------------|---------------------|---------------|
|                                              | <u>CATEGORY</u>     | <u>RATING</u> |

**I. PRESENTATION**

**A. National or international professional meetings**

**1. Presentations**

|                                     |       |     |
|-------------------------------------|-------|-----|
| a. Honorary lecture/keynote         | S, R* | A+  |
| b. Invited lecture                  | S,    | A   |
| c. Lecture (submitted and accepted) | S, R* | A-B |
| d. Panel participant                | S, R* | A-B |
| e. Chair/moderator of session/panel | S, R* | A-B |
| f. Poster presentation              | S, R* | B-C |
| g. Organizer                        | S, R* | A   |

**2. Workshop**

|                                   |       |   |
|-----------------------------------|-------|---|
| a. Lecture (Individual (B))       | S, R* | B |
| b. Lecture (Joint (C))            | S, R* | C |
| c. Demonstration (Individual (B)) | S, R* | B |
| d. Demonstration (Joint (C))      | S, R* | C |
| e. Organizer (Individual (A))     | S,    | A |
| f. Organizer (Joint (B))          | S,    | B |

**B. Professional groups, organizations, etc. (guilds, regional center staff, allied professional groups, etc.)**

**1. Presentations**

|                                     |       |     |
|-------------------------------------|-------|-----|
| a. Honorary lecture                 | S,    | A   |
| b. Invited lecture                  | S,    | A-B |
| c. Lecture (submitted and accepted) | S, R* | B   |
| d. Panel participant                | S, R* | B   |
| e. Chair/moderator of session/panel | S, R* | B   |
| f. Poster presentation              | S, R* | C   |
| g. Organizer                        | S, R* | A   |

**2. Professional Workshop**

|                                              |       |     |
|----------------------------------------------|-------|-----|
| a. Lecture (Individual (A), Joint (B))       | S, R* | B-C |
| b. Demonstration (Individual (B), Joint (C)) | S, R* | B-C |
| c. Organizer (Individual (A), Joint (B))     | S,    | A-B |

|                                                                                       |       |   |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|---|
| C. Institutional invitation to lecture/moderate a workshop (museum, university, etc.) | S, R* | A |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|---|

## II. PUBLICATION

|                                                                                                            |       |      |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|------|
| A. National/international professional journals (peer-reviewed)                                            |       |      |
| 1. Full paper                                                                                              | S, R* | A    |
| 2. Review article                                                                                          | S     | A    |
| 3. Note                                                                                                    | S, R* | B-C  |
| 4. Book review                                                                                             | S     | B-C  |
| B. Other professional/semi-professional journals (non-peer-reviewed)                                       |       |      |
| 1. Full paper                                                                                              | S, R* | B    |
| 2. Review article                                                                                          | S     | B    |
| 3. Note                                                                                                    | S, R* | C    |
| 4. Book review                                                                                             | S     | C    |
| 5. Regular column on conservation                                                                          | S     | B-C  |
| C. Popular publications (magazine, newspaper, radio, TV, Internet)                                         |       |      |
| 1. Major article (interview)                                                                               | S     | A-C  |
| 2. Short paper or note                                                                                     | S     | C    |
| 3. Book review                                                                                             | S     | C    |
| 4. Column on conservation/science                                                                          | S     | A-C  |
| 5. Essay in museum catalog                                                                                 | S     | A-B  |
| 6. Dissemination of research on the internet (website, blog, streaming instructional video, podcast, etc.) | S     | B-C  |
| D. Books (including e-books), monographs, etc.                                                             |       |      |
| 1. Book/monograph for professionals                                                                        | S     | A+   |
| 2. Textbook/monograph for professionals                                                                    | S     | A+   |
| 3. Chapter in book/monograph for professionals                                                             | S, R* | A+-A |
| 4. Technical leaflets, etc., published by a professional organization                                      | S     | B    |

## III. HONORS, FELLOWSHIP AWARDS, AND OTHER RECOGNITION

|                                                                                |        |      |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------|------|
| A. Honorary citation/award by national/international professional organization | S*, R* | A+   |
| B. Award of a research grant or fellowship (PI)                                | S*, R* | A+-A |
| C. Receive a contract to support a conservation and/or science activity        | S*     | B-C  |
| D. Collaborator of awarded research grant                                      | S*, R* | B-C  |
| E. Academic recognition for research                                           | R*     | A-C  |
| F. Presentation award for best paper/poster                                    | S, R   | B-C  |

## IV. POSITIONS HELD IN PROFESSIONAL ORGANIZATIONS

|                                                            |    |      |
|------------------------------------------------------------|----|------|
| A. Invited grant proposal review                           | S* | B+   |
| B. Professional journal                                    |    |      |
| 1. Editor (associate editor)                               | S* | A+-A |
| 2. Occasional reviewer                                     | S* | B    |
| C. Chair (Member) of national/international advisory panel | S* | A-B  |

|                                                                              |    |                |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|----------------|
| D. Elected member status in national/international professional organization | S* | B              |
| E. Offices in national/international professional organizations              |    |                |
| 1. Chief officer                                                             | S* | A <sup>+</sup> |
| 2. Member of board of directors                                              | S* | A              |
| 3. Committee chair (member)                                                  | S* | A-B            |
| 4. Specialty group                                                           |    |                |
| i. Chief officer (other officer)                                             | S* | A-B            |
| ii. Committee chair (member)                                                 | S* | B-C            |

## V. CONTRIBUTIONS IN RESEARCH, SCHOLARSHIP, AND CREATIVE ACTIVITY

|                                                                                 |         |       |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|-------|
| A. Other activities involving research, scholarship, and creative activities    |         |       |
| 1. Ongoing research with evidence of productivity                               | S, R, C | A-C   |
| 2. Involvement in student research projects (internal and external departments) | S, R, C | A-B   |
| 3. Ongoing work on a book or other major publication                            | S, R, C | B     |
| 4. Progress towards an advanced degree or other advanced training               | S, R, C | B-C   |
| 5. Committee member for a Ph.D. or other graduate project (external department) | S*      | A,B,C |
| 6. Applied research (such as conservation treatment)                            |         |       |
| 7. Case studies                                                                 |         |       |